Examining Women’s Lives Amidst Serial Wars

“T here is a very powerful paradigm, across many domains and across many societies, where war is understood as a project of men to protect women,” said Catherine Lutz, the Thomas J. Watson, Jr. Family Professor of Anthropology and International Studies.

“There is often a belief that this is embedded in our genetic code,” she added. “But the socially complex and constructed institution of warfare is often planned by states and executed by states. It has nothing to do with anger and aggression in individuals.

“We have to step back from the moment of violence, which is often man on man violence, and look at all of the institutional pieces and the social context which create war and to which the consequences devolve.

“To the extent that we only look at the battlefield, we keep focusing on those heroics and the suffering of soldiers. We don’t see that the vast majority of the bloody harvests of war are civilians. Women are not just the victims of war,” added Lutz. “In many societies, women have important roles to play in preparing for war and in supporting war and the institutions of violence.”

Anila Daulatzai, the Louise Lamphere Visiting Assistant Professor of Anthropology and Gender and Sexuality Studies, observed that women were used as the justification for the war in Afghanistan.

“‘The spectacular headlines that we read about the reasons justifying the war in the first place were to ‘save the women,’” said Daulatzai. “And the question is, save them from what?’

“The headlines focused on the years of Taliban rule and made it seem as though the only thing that women were suffering from were the Taliban,” said Daulatzai. She reminded the audience that the first war refugees in Afghanistan appeared in 1978 from the Soviet occupation. Afghanistan has endured thirty-seven years of warfare, and not just five years of Taliban rule.

Lutz and Daulatzai spoke during Brown’s Family and Alumni Fall Weekend for the Pembroke Center Associates event, “War Stories: Women in Conflict Zones.” Suzanne Stewart-Steinberg P’19, director of the Pembroke Center and professor of Italian Studies and Comparative Literature, moderated the panel.

“The costs of war

“Afghanistan is extremely unstable – even more so than prior to 2001. One indicator is heroin production, which has seen a more than forty-fold increase since 2001,” said Daulatzai. “My current work focuses on war and its relation to heroin use, but also on the return of polio. These are all costs of this war.

“Polio is back. Medical and public health professions had conquered polio – yet why is it back? How did it come back? It is all part of war and militarization.”

“When you put together civilians, soldiers, humanitarian workers, and journalists, from the numbers that have been counted – a very inadequate number – [the deaths] are almost 400,000,” observed Lutz. “That number you probably have to double to get to the number who were not counted. In addition, there are indirect war deaths...
From the Director

Earlier this semester, Brown released data from the Report on the Association of American Universities Campus Climate Survey on Sexual Assault and Sexual Misconduct. I read the report with great concern, as the report’s findings were deeply troubling. Twenty-five percent of Brown undergraduate women and 6.8 percent of undergraduate men who took the survey reported that they had experienced either unwanted sexual touching or attempted or completed penetration due to physical force or incapacitation. Last spring, Brown’s Sexual Assault Task Force issued a report with recommendations for addressing sexual and gender-based violence and harassment on campus.

But in addition to the Administration’s efforts to implement recommendations from the Sexual Assault Task Force’s report, something else is happening on campus. Discussing sex and sexuality—even in the classroom for academic purposes—has become very fraught. Some students who have experienced sexual assault or other trauma ask to be warned if material they are required to read contains potentially distressing content—and may refuse to read anything that might elicit painful emotional responses. Faculty seek to respect and honor the needs of our students, but how do we engage with the discourse around campus sexual violence, including the question of consent, the use of trigger warnings, and Title IX policies and applications. We welcome back to campus Joan Wallach Scott, Harold F. Linder Professor of Social Science Emerita at the Institute for Advanced Study and the founding director of the Pembroke Center, to deliver the keynote address. Please visit our website at www.pembrokecenter.org to learn more about the program.

I would like to welcome and thank Drew Walker, our new associate director and director of Gender and Sexuality Studies, for taking the lead in organizing this event. You may read more about Walker on page 7. I also would like to thank Denise Davis, managing editor of the Center’s journal differences and lecturer in Gender and Sexuality Studies, for her crucial contributions to the symposium.

Thank you for your ongoing support of the Pembroke Center. Our ability to contend with issues such as these is made possible by your generosity, and I am deeply grateful.

Sincerely,

Suzanne Stewart-Steinberg P’19
Director

PEMBROKE CENTER FOR TEACHING AND RESEARCH ON WOMEN
Brown University - Box 1958, Providence, RI 02912
PHONE: (401) 863-3650 FAX: (401) 863-1298 EMAIL: Pembroke_Center@brown.edu
www.brown.edu/pembrokecenter
Examining Women’s Lives  Continued from page 1

[because] war upsets access to healthcare, to a food supply, to employment, to all of the things that allow people to be healthy and survive troubles.”

Lutz went on to discuss the cost to U.S. taxpayers. “The number for what’s called the ‘Overseas Contingency Operation Budget’ is the dollars allocated just for those wars in Iraq and Afghanistan. That number approaches a trillion dollars.”

But, Lutz argued, the real figure should include: other parts of the federal budget where costs have been allocated; future obligated costs for service members who have been disabled and for whom health care is going to be provided; and interest on the debt, because these wars were paid for by borrowing. That total is $4.4 trillion, or $4,400,000,000,000.

Lutz codirects the “Costs of War” project that examines the far-reaching price of wars in Iraq, Afghanistan, and Pakistan. Daulatzai is a contributor to the project. To learn more about the project and read papers by Lutz, Daulatzai, and other scholars, please visit: www.costsofwar.org.

THE MEANING OF SERIAL WARS

Daulatzai argued that ongoing war causes great suffering for women, noting that she has met families who have lost all of their men. In one family, every female—ages ranging from fourteen to over sixty—were widowed, and sometimes serially widowed many times over.

“These are very long wars. There have been thirty-seven years of war in Afghanistan and decades of war in Iraq as well,” said Lutz. “The impact on those societies is that much more profound.”

Lutz spoke to the destruction of the Iraqi university system that had once been among the best in the Middle East. “When you deconstruct a university system you deconstruct the next generation’s ability to create and to make and to support a way of life.”

“For many Americans, the model of war is small moments in our history: four years of World War II, a few years of World War I,” she said. “It is not even like that for us anymore in the United States, and it has certainly not been like that in Iraq and Afghanistan.”

“The war won’t be over in Afghanistan, Iraq, Pakistan, or the United States for decades. If it ended tomorrow and all the combatants put down their arms and reconstruction started, these long-term impacts would continue,” continued Lutz. “We are now in the peak years for the financial costs for supporting the disabled veterans of the Vietnam War.”

“As a scholar and as a feminist, I can’t just focus on specific years that might be emblematic, such as the ‘Taliban years’ from 1995 to 2001. I cannot truncate all of women’s suffering to five years and choose not to focus on the complexity of what Afghans have had to endure serially since 1978,” said Daulatzai. “A twenty-five-year-old knows nothing but war and life as a refugee, a thirty-year-old, the same thing. A forty-year-old would have been three-years old.”

THE HAZARDS OF HUMANITARIANISM

Men usually run bakeries in Afghanistan. There was a special program run by the World Food Program that employed widows. The bakeries used fortified wheat from the United States that was healthier, and widows received bread daily to take home as part of their compensation for working there.

Since Daulatzai studies widowhood, she chose to work in bakeries alongside the widows for several months. “These bakeries became a showcase for the U.S. State Department,” she observed.

Daulatzai recalls visits from high-level State Department and other international officials who would observe the women baking bread and were not aware that Daulatzai spoke fluent English. The diplomats spoke of how “beautiful and heartwarming” it was to see Afghan widows baking bread and that now they were “liberated.”

Daulatzai translated what the diplomats were saying and the Afghan women were furious. The work was physically grueling, they worked ten hours a day for very little pay, and often had to walk more than an hour to get back home and then take care of their families.

“They did not at all feel liberated, I can tell you that,” said Daulatzai. “They were highly offended by the idea that they were being cared for by the program.

In a similar vein, programs to educate girls also fall short of claims of success.

“They do not seem to all feel liberated, I can tell you that,” said Daulatzai. “They were highly offended by the idea that they were being cared for by the program.

“In a similar vein, programs to educate girls also fall short of claims of success.

“The U.S. State Department put out numbers about the number of people in schools. That report has been critiqued as way too good to be true,” observed Lutz. “The United States put huge amounts of money into the building of buildings, not teacher training.” They counted the seats in a classroom – not the students attending.

“There are a lot of empty schools and hospitals in Afghanistan,” concluded Daulatzai.

PHOTO CREDIT: HANK RANDALL
Supporting Faculty Research at the Pembroke Center

Part of the Pembroke Center’s mission is to support Brown faculty in advancing research. The Center supports faculty research in a number of ways.

CHESLER- MALLOW SENIOR FACULTY RESEARCH FELLOWSHIP

This fellowship provides senior faculty with the opportunity to lead the Pembroke Seminar, develop a theme related to their research interests, and bring together a group of scholars to explore related questions. The fellowship provides time off from teaching so that the faculty member may focus on leading the seminar for the academic year. It is made possible through the generosity of Ellen Chesler, Ph.D., ’02 and Matthew J. Mallow ’64, ’08 LHD hon., P’02. This year’s Chesler-Mallow Senior Faculty Fellow is Joan Copjec, professor of Modern Culture and Media.

FACULTY FELLOWSHIPS

The Center offers the Edwin and Shirley Seave Faculty Fellowship, made possible through the generous support of Pembroke Center Associates Council member Ava Seave ’77, and the Edith Goldthwaite Miller Faculty Fellowship, made possible by Pembroke Center Associates Council member and former chair, Jean Miller ’49. Both fellowships provide time off from teaching so faculty may participate in the Pembroke Seminar and have dedicated time to advance their research in the collaborative environment of the Pembroke Seminar. This year’s Seave Faculty Fellow is Ellen Rooney, professor of Modern Culture and Media and English and former director of the Pembroke Center. Catherine Lutz, Thomas J. Watson, Jr. Family Professor of Anthropology and International Studies, holds the Miller Faculty Fellowship this year.

SEED GRANTS

The Pembroke Center supports collaborative faculty research projects through its seed grant program. In keeping with the Pembroke Center’s intellectual mission, these research initiatives examine intersecting dimensions of difference such as gender, sexuality, class, race, ethnicity, language, citizenship, and religion. This program is made possible by the generosity of alumnae/i donors who contributed to the Pembroke Challenge, led by former Council Chair Elizabeth Munves Sherman ’77, P’06, P’09. We are pleased to share the supported projects for the 2015–16 academic year.

Approaching War

This project brings together faculty from across the University in a working group that is developing and presenting research on the history, representations, manifestations, and presences of war. In parallel with the Pembroke Center’s four-year research initiative, “Thinking War Differently: A Collaborative Critical Project,” the working group is a forum for faculty and graduate students from different disciplines to establish and explore common theoretical and methodological questions. Most of Brown’s humanities and social sciences departments have at least one faculty member whose research addresses an aspect of war.

The project is codirected by Esther Whitfield, associate professor of Comparative Literature and Hispanic Studies, and Ariella Azoulay, professor of Comparative Literature and Modern Culture and Media. The working group meets monthly and includes Brown faculty and graduate students from a wide range of disciplines, including History, Political Science, Middle East Studies, Sociology, Comparative Literature, German Studies, Modern Culture and Media, Religious Studies, and Theatre Arts and Performance Studies.

Participants are studying different meanings and uses of the term war to explore its different aspects and modes of articulation and to question the role wars play in modern politics—including in postcolonial processes in the form of “liberation wars.” Special attention is being paid to different forms of opposition to war, that is, to pacifist and suffragist movements, writings, and events; to civil protest and actions; to anarchist gatherings, and feminist-socialist oppositions; and various cultures of hypochondria and their uses as means to evade the draft, cultures that produced figures such as the absconder, runaway, fugitive, defector, renegade, turncoat, and traitor. The working group is exploring a variety of visual and textual material in studying the role of technologies in the perpetuation of wars, the political and economic interests in determining war end(s) and beginning(s), women’s role and participation in wars and their subordination through rape, as well as narratives and figures of war over time. The project will culminate with a guest lecture in the spring semester.
A recent study published in Nature analyzed over 5,400,000 peer-reviewed articles in the natural and social sciences published from 2008 to 2012, in journals around the world (Lariviere et al. 2013). They found that articles with women authors (whether sole authors or co-authors) are cited less frequently than those without. These findings on gender disparities in citation are consistent with the main trend of research that has been done since the 1970s on the nature and extent of gender’s impact on the production of knowledge and the evaluation of scholars.

The discipline of anthropology is an increasingly female field in terms of the production of PhDs and the make-up of university faculty rosters in the discipline (the American Anthropological Association membership is now sixty-four percent female). Indeed, the Nature study cited above found the gender disparity in citations to be most pronounced in the most male-dominated fields like computer science, engineering, and math. The editor of the American Anthropologist, the discipline’s flagship journal, examined the pattern of citation to his journal’s articles for the decade of the 2000s in a recent article (Chibnik 2014). Using a very basic research design, he interpreted his results to indicate an absence of gender bias in citation, at least for this set of articles.

This research project examines a wider array of four disciplinary journals, codes them for the subdisciplinary and topical foci of each article, and otherwise follows the lead of a well-designed study of gender citation patterns in the field of international relations (Maliniak, Powers, and Walter 2013).

The project is codirected by Matthew Gutmann, professor of Anthropology, director of the Brown International Advanced Research Institutes, and faculty research fellow at the Watson Institute; Catherine Lutz, Thomas J. Watson, Jr. Family Professor of Anthropology and International Studies; and Susan Short, professor of Sociology and faculty associate at the Population Studies and Training Center. Grant funds are being used to pay Brown graduate students Jessica Katzenstein (Anthropology) and Amy Teller (Sociology) to undertake coding and data analysis of hundreds of articles. Seed grant funds also are supporting a workshop with project team members and other Brown faculty.

**Feminist Citation Practices in Anthropology**

**Freedom’s Cost: Learning from the Past to Change the Future**

This project positions children and youth at the center of the post–World War II African American movements for civil rights by addressing activism’s personal and communal costs. Blending civil rights movement histories with the burgeoning fields in trauma studies, the project adds dimension to the heroic narrative, exposing complicated and long-term realities for many young people. The black freedom struggle and the fight for equality often utilized the language of war. Activists saw themselves as foot soldiers in a nonviolent movement army against formidable state-sanctioned powers. Therefore, this project involves a rethinking of activism, mental health, and loss through the interdisciplinary lenses of race, childhood studies, trauma studies, psychology, memory, and the literature of war and post-traumatic stress disorder.

Directed by Françoise N. Hamlin, associate professor of History and Africana Studies, the project has brought together veterans to tell their stories alongside health care providers who themselves are veterans and practitioners. Held on the Brown campus, the gathering included a closed meeting of participants and a public roundtable that allowed Brown’s students to meet and hear from the participants. The public roundtable “Black Lives Matter: Recognizing and Minimizing Trauma among Black Youth” was held on September 21, 2015 and discussed the effects of trauma among black youth both in the past and in the ongoing struggle for freedom. Panelists included: David Dennis, director of the Southern Initiative Algebra Project and civil rights movement veteran; Corey Walker, dean of the College of Arts, Sciences, Business, and Education and Hanes Professor of the Humanities at Winston-Salem State University; Oliver Hill, Jr., professor of Psychology at Virginia State University; and Kevin Favor, professor of Psychology at Lincoln University.

The seed grant is also supporting a research assistantship for Hassani Scott. Scott is participating in the Brown-Tougaloo exchange this semester and is working directly with Veterans of the Mississippi Civil Rights Movement.
Visiting Scholar Ann duCille MFA’73, AM ’88, PhD ’91

From Barbie dolls to popular television shows, feminist scholar Ann duCille uncovers the complications of representing race in products marketed to us for entertainment.

The Pembroke Center is very pleased to welcome Ann duCille, Emerita Professor of English at Wesleyan University, as a visiting scholar this year. She has deep connections with both the Pembroke Center and Brown University and has generously supported the Center’s work with membership gifts to the Associates.

Ann duCille earned her MFA at Brown in 1973 and spent more than a decade working in community arts organizations, writing poetry, and teaching. She returned to Brown to pursue a PhD in American Civilization, which she earned in 1991. Ellen Rooney, professor of Modern Culture and Media and English, was her dissertation director and introduced her to the Pembroke Center.

“I am very honored to have been invited to be a visiting scholar here,” said duCille. While at the Pembroke Center, she is participating in this year’s Pembroke Seminar on “Fatigue,” led by Joan Copjec, professor of Modern Culture and Media. She also is working on her new research project.

RACE ON TELEVISION

In this project, “Technicolored: Reflections on Race in the Time of TV,” duCille is examining how race is represented across all genres – from reality shows such as Judge Judy to ABC’s hit dramas Scandal and How to Get Away with Murder, and in classic game shows now hosted by Black comedians such as Family Feud and Let’s Make a Deal.

Having grown up in the age of television, she has watched it from its very beginning and remembers a time in the 1950s when Black people were only on television as maids, butlers, and chauffeurs. Today she sees lots of Black people on television, but all is not well.

Television is a fixture in the American home, and duCille considers its representation of race to be very important. She recalls that her mother, an avid fan of game shows who would outplay nearly every contestant she watched, abruptly stopped watching Wheel of Fortune because she was so upset with Black contestants who did not play well.

“They, realist,” said duCille, “that I have been watching television in the same way as my mother” in that she was concerned about how Black people appear on television.

The project began, duCille recalls, from watching reruns of Perry Mason and recalling how as a young girl she admired how Mason went to great lengths within the law to successfully defend his almost always innocent clients.

“As a little girl, I wanted to grow up to be Perry Mason, but I could not then imagine a world where a Black woman could become a famous criminal defense attorney,” said duCille.

She contrasted the heroic character of Perry Mason with the character of Annalise Keating, a Black woman criminal defense attorney and law professor on How to Get Away with Murder. In this show, Keating will do almost anything inside or outside the law to get her guilty clients acquitted.

Reality television fares no better under duCille’s analysis.

“Judge Judy is one of the most dangerous shows on television,” observed duCille. Taking issue with how the show is an assemblage of conflict and arbitration, duCille notes that “on this show you don’t just see people of color with problems; you see people of color who are the problem.”

She argues that this leaves very little room for Black men to be represented as anything other than thugs, pimps, and gangbangers and that this representation has a connection to the very real and tragic violence that is perpetrated on members of the Black community today.
Introducing Drew Walker

The Pembroke Center is pleased to announce that Drew Walker has accepted the position of Associate Director and Director of Gender and Sexuality Studies. In this role, he provides administrative leadership for the Pembroke Center, plans major events, and directs the undergraduate Gender and Sexuality Studies concentration. Walker’s educational experience is interdisciplinary, like the Pembroke Center itself. He studied philosophy and religious studies as an undergraduate at Millsaps College. After completing his undergraduate degree, he spent three months in a Zen monastery in Japan before returning to do graduate work at Harvard Divinity School. After completing his Master of Theological Studies degree and before pursuing his PhD, Walker taught Religious Studies for four years in independent high schools, including a year at St. Paul’s School for Girls in Baltimore, Maryland.

Walker’s teaching at the Pembroke Center focuses on the intersections of feminist and queer theory and politics. This semester he is teaching the senior seminar in the concentration. In Spring 2015, he will teach a new course, “Feminist Theory and Critiques of Capitalism.” Looking forward, he plans to offer courses on radical political thought, as well as the politics of intimacy and desire.

The Pembroke Center is very grateful for Drew Walker returning to Providence. “After retiring from Wesleyan, I decided to move back to Providence,” says duCille. “I’m going against the grain and proving that you can come home again. Providence is for me the city of eternal return.”

The Pembroke Center is very grateful that duCille has returned to Providence to our scholarly community and honored that she has committed her scholarly papers and other materials to the Center’s Feminist Theory Archive.

MULTICULTURAL BARBIE DOLLS

Perhaps duCille’s most famous work is her research on Barbie dolls, which began in the 1993 Pembroke Center roundtable, “Multiculturalism, Primitivism, Postmodernism.”

She recalls shopping for Christmas weeks before the roundtable and being struck by the “Jamaican Barbie” on the shelf. It was cast from the same mold as all the white Barbies, but with a change of hair color, skin color, and costume. She kept thinking about that Barbie and decided to purchase several different Barbies and bring them to the roundtable.

“Everybody at the roundtable had a Barbie story,” recalls duCille. “The dolls became central to our discussion and a way to talk about race, gender, and difference.”


In the differences article, duCille challenges an “easy pluralism that simply adds what it constructs as ‘The Other without upsetting the fundamental precepts and paradigms of Western culture.’” She also contests the possibility of adjusting facial features and body types to create a doll that would “authentically” represent a particular race or ethnicity.

She asks, “What would it take to produce a line of dolls that more fully reflects the wide variety of sizes, shapes, colors, hair styles, occupations, abilities, and disabilities that African Americans – like all people – come in? In other words: what price difference?”

FULL CIRCLE

“After retiring from Wesleyan, I decided to move back to Providence,” says duCille. “I’m going against the grain and proving that you can come home again. Providence is for me the city of eternal return.”

The Pembroke Center is very grateful that duCille has returned to Providence to our scholarly community and honored that she has committed her scholarly papers and other materials to the Center’s Feminist Theory Archive.
I’d like to make a gift to the Pembroke Center Associates!

Membership gifts to the Pembroke Center Associates support the research, teaching, archives and alumnae/i programs sponsored by the Pembroke Center.

- $5,000 + Sarah Doyle Society
- $2,500 – $4,999 Anna Canada Swain Partners
- $1,000 – $2,499 Elisha Benjamin Andrews Benefactors
- $500 – $999 Patron
- $250 – $499 Sponsor
- $100 – $249 Sustaining Member
- $75 – $99 Contributing Member
- $50 – $74 Associate Member
- Other $ __________

Name _____________________________________________________________ Class/Affiliation ____________

Address ______________________________________________________________________________________________________

City ________________________________________ State ________________ Zip ___________________

☐ My check is enclosed, payable to Brown University.

☐ Please charge my credit card:
  ☐ MasterCard  ☐ Visa  ☐ American Express  ☐ Discover

Account number ____________________________ Expiration __________

Signature ____________________________

Please return this form with payment to:
Pembroke Center Associates, Box 1877, Brown University, Providence, RI 02912

You also may contribute to the Pembroke Center Associates via Brown University’s secure Web server: https://gifts.development.brown.edu/pembroke/

Questions? Please call (401) 863-3650
See who else is a member: www.pembrokecenter.org/associates/current